

Appendix D

Supplementary Best Practices Review

1 Pricing Strategies

This section provides an in-depth examination of the comparator municipality parking prices. Note that prices for cities in the United States are in USD.

Edmonton

The City of Edmonton enforces paid on-street parking 24/7. Parking prices range from \$1.00 to \$3.50 Monday to Friday based on location. On-street parking is \$1.00 on Saturdays and free on Sundays, except for certain zones around the University of Alberta campus. There is a special hourly rate of \$3.50 from 5:00 PM to 10:00 PM near Rogers Place Arena during special events. Maximum parking duration is either 2 or 5 hours, depending on the parking facility.

Edmonton has three Downtown parkades. Parking in the Canada Place and Library parkades is \$5.00 per hour Monday to Friday, with different maximum rates from 6:00 AM to 6:00 PM, 5:00 PM to 2:00 AM, midnight to 8:00 AM, and midnight to midnight. Saturday and Sunday parking rates are \$2.00 per hour, with different maximum prices for the same periods as outlined for Monday to Friday. A monthly parking permit costs \$315.00.

The City Hall parkade is the only parkade to employ time based pricing. Monday-Friday hourly parking prices, with variable maximum prices, are \$4.00 from 6:00 AM to 5:00 PM, \$2.00 from 5:00 PM to midnight, and \$1.00 from midnight to 8:00 AM. Saturday and Sunday hourly parking, also with variable maximum rates, are \$2.00 from 6:00 AM to 5:00 PM, \$2.00 from 5:00 PM to midnight, and \$1.00 from midnight to 8:00 AM. Parking prices during special events is \$4.00 per hour from 5:00 PM to midnight with a \$16.00 maximum price. Monthly permits are not available at the City Hall parkade

Buffalo

The City of Buffalo enforces paid on-street parking throughout the city. On-street parking prices vary based on zones. From November 15th to April 1st, winter on-street parking along bus routes is restricted. Buffalo also offers off-street parking at seven ramps, which are structured off-street parking garages, in the Downtown through Buffalo Civic Auto Ramps. Most ramps charge \$2.00 per hour during the daytime, and \$4.00 per hour on evenings (after 5pm) and weekends. The first two hours of evening and weekend parking are free at some ramps. Special event parking is available at most ramps for a flat price between \$5.00 and \$10.00.

Monthly parking permits are available at most ramps, ranging in cost from \$30.00 to \$105.00.

Hartford

Hartford charges \$2.00 per hour for on-street parking in the central Downtown. On-street parking on the streets surrounding the Downtown is \$1.00 per hour.

Off-street parking is available at the MAT garage, which operates from 6:30 AM to 11:30 PM on weekdays and 8:00 AM to 11:30 PM on weekends. Weekday day-time parking costs \$3.00 per hour, while evening (after 6:00 PM) and weekend parking costs \$6.50. A day-time monthly parking permit costs \$165.00, while evening monthly permits cost \$75.00.

San Francisco

San Francisco first implemented a performance based pricing strategy through the SFpark pilot in 2011. The pilot project resulted in increased sales tax revenues, reduced parking prices, decreased parking search time, and decreased daily vehicle miles travelled. Given the pilot's success, the performance based pricing program was adopted system wide in 2017. The strategy aims to maintain parking occupancy between 60-80%. Parking payment data is used to estimate

parking occupancy levels. A \$0.25 per hour price increase occurs for facilities where the average occupancy is above 80%. A \$0.25 per hour price decrease occurs for facilities where average occupancy is below 60%. Prices do not change for facilities that are between the target occupancy of 60-80%. Price changes occur once every three months, and residents are informed if prices are adjusted along the street they live on.

Time based pricing is also used where daily prices vary between the following time periods: midnight to 9:00 AM, 9:00 AM to noon, noon to 3:00 PM, 3:00 PM to 6:00 PM, and 6:00 PM to midnight. Hourly parking prices range from \$0.00 to \$8.00 and are generally more expensive during peak periods in the Downtown. Note that parking prices can decrease to \$0.00 per hour in underutilized areas. Metered parking time limits vary based on location.

Monthly parking permits are available at some off-street parking facilities and can cost over \$300.00.

Ottawa

The City of Ottawa offers paid on-street parking in various zones. Hourly prices range from \$1.50 to \$3.50, maximum durations range from 2 to 3 hours, and the days of the week range from Monday to Friday and Monday to Saturday. Downtown parking is generally more expensive

Ottawa also operates twelve off-street parking lots. Off-street hourly prices range from \$1.00 to \$4.00, with varying maximum parking prices. Prices are generally split into a daytime and evening for both weekdays and weekends, however the specific time periods for daytime and evening vary between lot.

Monthly parking is available at some off-street lots, and range in cost from \$65.00 to \$225.00.

Calgary

On-street paid parking in Calgary is mostly limited to the Downtown. Calgary adopted performance based pricing for on-street parking in 2013, with 27 pricing areas. On-street prices are reviewed annually, with price adjustments occurring in increments of \$0.25 per hour based on demand. The target occupancy level is between 50-80%; prices do not change when these occupancy levels are present. Parking prices are increased by \$0.25 per hour in areas where occupancy exceeds 80%, and prices are decreased by \$0.25 per hour in areas where occupancy is below 50%. Prices can vary throughout the weekday and are generally grouped in the following periods: 9:00 AM to 11:00 AM, 11:00 AM to 3:30 PM, and 3:30 PM to 6:00 PM. There is a single hourly rate on Saturdays from 9:00 AM to 6:00 PM with prices ranging from \$0.00 to \$5.00 per hour. Similar to San Francisco, parking prices can decrease to \$0.00 per hour in underutilized areas. Parking is generally free on Sundays and holidays.

The city operates seventeen parkades with hourly prices ranging from \$1.00 to \$8.00. These hourly prices, and the associated maximum prices, vary between daytime weekday, daytime weekend, and evening (all week) rates. Monthly parking prices for off-street parkades range from \$125.00 to \$485.00.

Seattle

The City of Seattle implemented a performance-based pricing strategy in 2010. They use parking transactions and counts to inform price changes with a desired occupancy level of 70-85%. If occupancy levels are below 70%, prices decrease by \$0.50 per hour. If occupancy levels are above 85%, prices increase by \$0.50 per hour. If an area is above or below the target range by 5% or less, price changes are deferred for a year and those areas are added to a watch list. Hourly parking prices are kept between \$0.50 and \$5.00. Changes are generally made on an annual basis. Parking prices vary between the following periods: 8:00 AM to 11:00 AM, 11:00 AM to 5/6 PM, and 5/6 PM to 8/10 PM. Paid parking is generally limited to 2 hours, 4 hours, or 10 hours Monday to Saturday and parking is free on Sundays.

Cleveland

The City of Cleveland adopted the location-based on-street pricing with highest prices in the Downtown, followed by institutional zones, and then all other areas.

The City also operates five off-street lots in the Downtown. Some lots have flat daily prices ranging between \$2.00 and \$4.00, while other lots have \$3.50 hourly price with each additional hour costing \$3.00. Monthly parking is available at some off-street lots, and ranges from \$55.00 to \$125.00.

Columbus

The City of Columbus implemented a performance-based pricing strategy, with a desired occupancy between 60-80%. If occupancy levels are over 80%, parking prices are increased by \$0.25 per hour. If utilization levels are between 30-60%, then parking prices are decreased by \$0.25 per hour. If utilization is below 30%, then parking prices are decreased by \$0.50 per hour. A city-wide parking price review occurs every 6 months, and parking services do not need council approval to adjust parking prices. There are no minimum or maximum parking prices. The media and neighbourhood organizations are informed when prices are adjusted. Parking prices vary based on meter durations (30 minute-meters are generally more expensive per hour than 3-hour meters) and times of day (day-time parking is generally cheaper than evening in some areas).

Austin

On-street parking prices in Austin are consistent throughout the pay parking area. The price starts at \$2.00 and increases as the parking duration increases to a maximum price of \$5.00 per hour. On-street parking hours vary throughout the City, and generally operate from 8:00 AM to midnight on weekdays and weekends (where applicable).

Off-street parking prices and hours vary by lot. The MoPac parking lot prices match on-street prices with pay parking in effect Monday to Friday between 8:00 AM and 6:00 PM. The I-35 parking lot costs \$2.00 per hour from 7:00 PM to 3:00 AM, or a \$7.00 and \$8.00 flat rate on Mondays to Thursdays and Fridays to Saturdays, respectively. The Emma S. Barrientos Mexican American Cultural Center parking lot enforces pay parking Monday to Saturday from 8:00 AM to 3:00 AM. Parking costs \$2.00 per hour from 8:00 AM to 6:00 PM with a \$5.00 flat rate from 6:00 PM to 3:00 AM.

San Antonio

San Antonio has fourteen off-street parking facilities throughout the city. Hourly prices range from \$1.00 to \$4.00, while some facilities offer a flat rate ranging from \$2.00 to \$10.00. Most lots offer parking throughout the week, prices vary by the day-of-week.

New Orleans

The City of New Orleans offers on-street parking Monday to Saturday from 8:00 AM to 7:00 PM. Hourly prices are \$3.00 in the French Quarter, Marigny, Central Business District, and Warehouse District and \$2.00 in all other areas. On-street parking is free on Sundays.

Windsor

Parking prices are generally consistent throughout the pay parking system. On-street parking costs \$1.75 per hour while off-street parking costs \$1.50 per hour. A \$2.00 flat rate is available in some off-street parking lots. Pay parking is generally in effect between 9:00 AM and 6:00 PM Monday to Saturday.

Winnipeg

On-street parking in Winnipeg costs \$1.75 per hour in traditionally underutilized facilities and \$2.75 per hour in popular areas, such as facilities in the Downtown, The Exchange, and near the Health Sciences Centre and hospital areas. On-street parking is generally limited to two hours between 9:00 AM and 5:30 AM.

Off-street parking generally costs \$3.00 per hour.

2 Residential and Visitor Parking Permits

This section provides an overview of the comparator municipality residential and visitor parking permit programs. Note that prices for cities in the United States are in USD.

Edmonton

Residential parking permits are offered to residents of single-family homes and multi-family buildings that are less than four storeys in specific neighbourhoods. These permits are free and are offered on an annual or temporary basis. Visitor parking permits are also available in some neighbourhoods, and each address is only allowed two visitor permits per year.

Buffalo

Residential parking permits are available to residents in the Fruit Belt neighbourhood (located next to the Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus). These are two-year permits that permit on-street residential parking on half of the street, while the other half of the street is available for public parking.

Hartford

The City of Hartford offers residential and visitor parking passes for \$25 per year on designated streets. Each household can apply for up to two residential permits and one visitor pass.

San Francisco

The City of San Francisco offers residential parking permits in designated zones. Each address can purchase between 2-4 permits depending on the zone, with each permit costing \$152 per year. Visitor permits are available that vary in both time and cost. Additional parking permits are also available for business parking, short-term parking, medical and child caregivers, teachers, diplomats, active military, and students.

Ottawa

The City of Ottawa offers residential parking permits for residents in designated areas that do not have access to off-street parking. These permits are available for \$700 per year. Visitor parking is also available and varies in cost based on duration and season. Additional parking permit types include accessible, business identity card, daycare, guest, healthcare, musician and artist loading, seasonal beach, special events, temporary consideration, and volunteer.

Calgary

The City of Calgary offers two free residential parking permits per household, and charges \$102.10 per two years for each additional permit. Two visitor permits are also available per household.

Seattle

The City of Seattle offers parking permits to residents who live in restricted parking zones. Prices vary by zone, and residents can submit applications to have existing restricted parking zones expanded or to add new restricted parking zones.

Cleveland

The City of Cleveland offers residential parking permits to residents in designated areas for \$5 per year to \$10 per year depending on the season. Residents are limited to up to two visitor permits at once, each permit lasting for a maximum of fourteen days. Business permit parking is also available.

Columbus

The City of Columbus offers residential parking permits to residents in permit parking zones for \$25 per year. Guest permit parking is also available, with the first five guest permits being free and each additional permit costing \$1.

Austin

The City of Austin offers annual residential parking permits and visitor hangtags that cost between \$20 and \$70 annually (the price increases with each additional permit purchased). Each residence can only have a maximum of six combined residential permits and visitor hangtags, while the Mueller area limits residents to only two combined residential permits and visitor hangtags.

San Antonio

The City of San Antonio offers residential and visitor parking permits for \$20 per year. Only one residential and visitor permit are permitted per address.

New Orleans

The City of New Orleans offers residential parking permits for residents in designated zones. These permits cost \$30 per year for residents up to 64 years and younger, and \$20 for students and residents aged 65 and older. Annual visitor permits cost \$30 per year. Each permit has an additional application fee of \$40. Each residential property owner can only possess one residential parking permit per zone.

Windsor

The City of Windsor offers a maximum of two residential vehicles permits per household in designated areas. The first residential permit costs \$35 per year, while the second residential permit costs \$20 per year. A visitor permit can also be purchased for \$35 per year.

Winnipeg

The City of Winnipeg offers up to three residential permits per residence, with each permit costing \$25 per year. Visitor parking permits are also available, and range in cost based on duration.